Keynote Speakers


CareFlite Symposium, Monday, June 22nd, 2009

Nadine Levick, MD MPH
Research Director, EMS Safety Foundation
CEO, Objective Safety
New York, USA

To quote Steve “Sid” Caesar – Director IHS ES
“We want everyone to get home safely each day”

Outline

I. Review of data on ambulance crashes and safety standards and guidelines that exist for the ground EMS
II. Identification of ground EMS transport safety issues, hazards and areas of risk to patients, providers and public
III. Highlight unacceptable mythology and challenges to advancing EMS transport safety
IV. Profile innovation, new safety technologies and strategies and knowledge transfer to enhance safety and reduce risks of ground EMS and patient transport

Real world answers to real world questions -

What features will enhance safety of my new vehicle purchase?
What color scheme do I want on my vehicle to make it safest?
Do I need a helmet, and if so which one?
What policies offer the safest system?
How do I get my team to address safety issues?
What data should I collect when something goes wrong, and how to analyze it?

Emergency Medical Service Transport

What are the transport safety issues that pertain to this important public service and public safety industry?
What do we know of the risks and hazards and how can we measure these?
How can the safety of this transport system be optimized?

Your Interactive Handout awaits you online at...

www.objectivesafety.net

This WILL be FAST!!
No need to take any notes – all text slides will be awaiting you in your online Handout

http://www.objectivesafety.net

Firstly!

An accident?

or a predictable and preventable event
A tragic emergency health care intervention outcome

It does happen....

A devastating tragedy...

- An ETT down the wrong hole may kill your patient and be a terrible burden for the pts family and for the medic involved
- BUT an EMS crash can kill all involved AND wipe out an EMS systems response capacity......

Ambulance Transport Safety

- Emergency care, public health, public safety, and patient transportation.
- Important Principle: Ambulance transport safety is part of a system, the overall balance of risk involves the safety of all occupants and the public
- All get home safely

In a nutshell

- Am here to try to save you
- Lives
- Time and
- Money

October 2008 JEMS Article “Rig Safety – 911”

USA EMS data

In the USA*
- ~ 50,000 vehicles
- ~ 5,000 crashes a year
- One fatality each week
- ~ 23 pedestrians or occupants of other car
- Approximately 4 child fatalities per year
- ~10 serious injuries each day
- Cost estimates > $500 million annually
- USA crash fatality rate/capita 35x higher than in Australia

Is it your service’s tragic year?

- ~ 50 fatalities a year
- 15,000 EMS services
- Each year one in 300 services experiences a fatality

Safety oversight of what and .... by whom

- Vehicle Safety
- Vehicle Design
- Transportation systems safety
- Safety Equipment Design
- Vehicle and Safety Equipment Testing and Standard development
- Safety policies

Creating a Safety Culture

within a company must start with upper management’s commitment to safety

- Awareness
- Training
- Incentive
Safety - Why now?

- Operating optimally in a transportation environment that is largely devoid of specific safety standards for the hazards and risks present
- Bridge the gap between what technical information exists and what is accessible and applied to EMS

The EMS transport process

- communications/dispatch
- the patient
- restraining devices/seat
- transporting device/gurney
- paramedics/transport nurses, doctors & family
- patient monitoring equipment
- clinical care & interventions
- protective equipment
- the vehicle
- the driving/driver skill
- other road users
- the road

The Emergency Department (ED)

An ambulance is not an ED/ICU on wheels

A survivable impact??

Thursday July 5th 2007......

Paramedic Allan Parson's killed
2 weeks later... Friday July 20th 2007
The worst ambulance crash in USA history

June 17th 2008
a paramedic and a patient killed

January 10, 2008
This is not a crashworthy environment

Jan 28th, 2008

In this vehicle...

January 10, 2008

County News
AMBULANCE ROLLS, INJURING 4

Jun 17th, 2008

This is not a crashworthy environment

In this vehicle...
EMS Safety

- ‘patient safety’
- AND also
- ‘provider’ and ‘public safety’

Very Important Principle

Ambulance transport safety is part of a SYSTEM, the overall balance of risk involves the safety of all occupants and the public

An interhospital transport?

“Do no harm…”?

Benefit of Safety

- This IS a Transportation and Automotive Safety issue

Some odd facts

- Ambulances are generally not built by the automotive industry
- Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS), transportation safety engineering is not generally integrated into EMS systems
- Although all EMS systems have medical direction and oversight, it is rare for there to be transportation expertise oversight

Testing the real world

- Any cost of addressing these issues is dwarfed in contrast to the huge burden of not doing so - in financial costs let alone the personal, societal, ethical and litigation costs
Unique workplace

- In vehicles
- At roadside and other emergency scenes

Absence of standards and oversight

- Challenges in identifying best practice
- Myriad of unregulated commercial products
- No safety performance standards
- Absent national safety oversight

What we need to consider, where is the 'bang for buck' in ambulance transport safety:

USA EMS in 1917

- A passenger vehicle - sure

1960 to 2009

- A passenger vehicle - ?

It does happen....

But what about head protection?

New EMS helmet prototypes for 2008-2009

- What's going to kill you?
- What's going to injure you?

So for EMS personnel...
Ground Transport Safety IS Complex AND Multidisciplinary

Epidemiological Data Collection
Risk Management
Public Safety
Transport Policy
PPE
Driver Training

Ergonomic Research
Biomechanical Automotive Safety
Software/Client research
Safety Technology
Regulations and Standards
Fast Safety Program

Ambulance Vehicle Standards??
- KKK?
- AMD?
- FMVSS?
- NFPA?

What KKK-A-1822F, AMD and FMVSS state and don't state...

USA KKK ambulance purchase specifications
- Specifications for the purchase of a Star of Life Ambulance
- Static Pull test
- 2200 Lbs. static stretcher test in longitudinal, lateral & vertical
- No dynamic test for vehicle, occupants or equipment
- No automotive test manikin
- Voluntary

USA Ambulance Manufacturing Division (AMD)
Ambulance Standards – August 2007
- No dynamic or impact test
- No automotive test manikin
- Mandates NO 'crumple zone'
- No impact tested anchorages for occupant restraint or equipment
- Internal, not independent

2009 USA ambulance ‘safety testing’ ??!
Not consistent with accepted automotive safety practice...

USA Ambulances: FMVSS Exemption
Department of Transportation
National Highway Traffic Safety Administration
400 CFPB Plaza, 5th, and CFF
[Office No. 512-947, Sector 1]
[Number 2171440051]

USA Ambulance Manufacturing Division (AMD)
Ambulance Standards – August 2007
- No dynamic or impact test
- No automotive test manikin
- Mandates NO ‘crumple zone’
- No impact tested anchorages for occupant restraint or equipment
- Internal, not independent

2009 USA ambulance ‘safety testing’ ??!
Not consistent with accepted automotive safety practice...

USA Ambulances: FMVSS Exemption
Department of Transportation
National Highway Traffic Safety Administration
400 CFPB Plaza, 5th, and CFF
[Office No. 512-947, Sector 1]
[Number 2171440051]
Patients must be in the over the shoulder harness, medics restrained in seat belts, equipment secured

What are the solutions?
- Training?
- Practice Policy?
- Transportation Systems Engineering?
- Automotive Engineering?
- Education of other road users???

Balance of concerns and risk during transport
- Response and transport time
- Clinical care provision
- Occupant safety/protection
- Public Safety

Safety Management
- A Safety Culture
- Protective Policies
- Protective Devices
  - To prevent a crash
  - In the event of a crash
- Continuous Education and Evaluation

And very Predictable...
- Intersections are lethal environments

So... The real world for an EMS vehicle approaching a red light
- You think they heard you...
- You know they must have seen you...
- And maybe they did
- ... But...
- There is NO way humanly possible that they could stop.....

The real world
Intersection passenger car stopping distance* at 40 mph dry and wet

The Crash Event - Crash Testing
- An introduction
- What one needs to know
- What do the tests really mean
- And, what tests are meaningful

* Stopping distance = Perception time + Reaction time + Vehicle braking time (varies with age, skill, agility, distance + vehicle type, tire pressure, road etc)
Intrusion vs Deceleration

- Intrusion = vehicle to vehicle or vehicle to fixed narrow object
- Deceleration = sudden stop – ie. sled test

Dynamic Safety Testing

- Requires sophisticated, expensive equipment
- Measurably demonstrates forces generated during collision
- Accepted international standard for vehicle restraint systems

Dynamic Safety Testing

What is actually happening during an ambulance crash

And this all takes place in 60 milliseconds – the blink of an eye

A few key words about restraint systems...

PPE from the stationary environment can be highly hazardous in the automotive setting

NOT new technical data...

Side facing 4-point harnesses demonstrated to be lethal, even at slow ground vehicle speeds.
Being seated IN an automotive seat is what will protect you

- Anything that allows or encourages you to get up out of your seat will also encourage you to be injured or killed – it is potentially lethal to be out of your seat in any fashion.
- 4 or 5 point harnesses for side-facing occupants are potentially lethal – and is in NO WAY SUPPORTED BY ANY DATA OR AUTOMOTIVE SAFETY EXPERTISE.

Rash of “Safety Concept” vehicles…..

- **Avoid** of substantive automotive safety engineering input or testing

Yes, the ride of your life….

- Sure... these vehicles all parade around the EMS and Fire shows BUT...
- NOT ONE of these vehicles has been to the automotive safety shows or scrutinized by the automotive safety industry.

Increasing awareness …

- Intersection crashes are the most lethal
- There are documented hazards, some which can be avoided
- Occupant and equipment restraint with standard belts is effective. (Over the shoulder harnesses for patients should be used, with the gurney in the upright position where medically feasible)
- Some vehicle design features are beneficial - automotive grade padding in head strike areas, seat that can slide toward the patient
- Electronic Driver monitoring/feedback systems appear to be highly effective
- Head protection??

What do we know now??

- Air EMS is a role model for safety initiatives and focus
- Transportation Research Board is an excellent resource... we should be using it!!

Innovation

- Safety concepts out there now
  - Driver feedback technologies
  - Tiered dispatch
  - Enhanced ambulance vehicle design
  - Intelligent Transport Technologies - ITS
  - New Safety Standards
What about changing driver behavior in the real world??

Purpose of ‘Feedback box’ Program
- Enhance Safety
- Improve Driver Performance
- Save Maintenance Dollars
- Aid Accident / Incident Investigation

How the Device Works
- Computerized monitoring device installed on each vehicle to measure parameters
- Each driver has individual key “fob”
- Data collected every second
  - including vehicle speed and performance, driver behaviors and emergency mode
- Auditory feedback of warning ‘growls’, and penalty tones
- Data downloaded automatically every day

Demonstrated Effectiveness

A key to safe ambulance transport

Extensive Indirect cost savings
- Fewer out of service vehicles
- Improved transport times
- Decreased administrative lost in managing unsafe behaviors
- Decreased legal burden
- Automatic system wide data
- Insurance benefits

Other monitoring devices
- Primarily to record events during and immediately preceding a crash
- Give no driver crash prevention feedback
- Administratively burdensome
- Intrusive
- Not demonstrated to be as effective in improving vehicle maintenance costs or as effective in modifying driver behavior long term

You want a system that works!!
- Does the system really work
- Is it going to be a major burden on your staff to implement
- What are the real costs
- Are you going to have video of your company vehicle on you tube??

Visibility and lighting issues
Hmm…

So why is it...

- That the EMS providers -
  - Were wearing navy blue – one of the most difficult colors to see at night
  - Had no head protection, when all other emergency personnel at the scene did
  - Had no protective clothing, when other emergency personnel at the scene did???

It isn’t like this outside of the USA

Worker viability Act: November 24th 2008

Day visibility

Night visibility

Policy and practice ignorant of existing technical safety data

This addresses some very real risks, very creatively – and currently ONLY available in London Ontario!
The state of the art non-USA vehicles have NO squad bench nor the after market structural vehicle modifications that can potentially decrease crashworthiness integrity that were seen in study vehicles.
High speed crash, rolled and the occupants (patient and medics) had only minor scratches.

Is crash safety tested by automotive experts?

Unlike this vehicle.

So....
- Which vehicle do you want to be in?
- Which vehicle is the best for efficient and effective patient care?
- Which vehicle provides optimal risk management?
- What is the optimal fleet mix?

Were we safer in the Cadillac???

Fleet Mix?

R & D “Ripoff and Duplicate”
- Avoid reinventing the wheel at all costs
- Where are the best practices that we need to transfer knowledge from

Tips for Emergency Vehicle Operations
USFA Emergency Vehicle Safety Initiative

Traffic Incident Management Systems (TIMS)

Risk/Hazards

What you can do now

What do we know works...

Important Principles!

Very Important Principle

small changes can make a BIG DIFFERENCE

PREDICTABLE PREVENTABLE and NO ACCIDENT
Conclusion

- EMS transport has serious hazards and safety issues
- Major advances in EMS safety research, infrastructure and practice over the past 5 years
- New technologies for vehicle design, occupant PPE and equipment restraint and driver performance are now available
- Development of substantive EMS safety standards is a necessity and a reality
- Failure to transfer knowledge from transportation and automotive safety is unacceptable and dangerous
- EMS is still way behind the state of the art in vehicle safety and occupant protection

And....

- It is no longer acceptable for EMS to be functioning outside of automotive safety and PPE safety standards for prevention of and protection of EMS providers and the public from injury and death

Thank you!
Any Questions??
Electronic handout available online
http://www.objectivesafety.net